



### **Subway – Award of Contract for the Renewal of Broomloan Depot Distribution Board Works**

**Date of meeting** 31 March 2017

**Date of report** 9 March 2017

#### **Report by Assistant Chief Executive (Operations)**

#### **1. Object of report**

To recommend the Partnership approve the award of contract for the renewal of Broomloan Depot Distribution Board works to Edmiston Brown & Co Ltd.

#### **2. Background**

The main power supply that feeds Broomloan depot is subsequently distributed to the various operational areas via a main distribution board and sub-boards that were installed in 1978. This system feeds all of the areas of the depot including maintenance shed, Subway Control Room, Stabling Shed, Govan de-watering system, Broomloan offices and Broomloan security gatehouse.

The main board, together with sub-distribution boards, have reached the end of their design life with spares being difficult to obtain with significant challenges on ongoing maintenance costs. Within this system, there is also limited spare capacity to make depot changes/isolations, which presents a major challenge for undertaking any modification/improvement works in the depot.

It is therefore critical that these assets are renewed to avoid the risk of failure within the depot and also to allow for future flexibility for the changes necessary with the new rolling stock and control systems and to also allow for smart metering to better manage consumption.

It is also critical that the works to replace these assets are undertaken in a carefully controlled and planned manner within the live operational environment of the depot.

This report sets out the results of the tender assessment to undertake the works for replacement of these critical assets.

#### **3. Outline of proposals**

##### **3.1 Scope of works**

The scope of works is summarised as follows:

- renewal of main electrical distribution board for the depot to provide a modern equipment solution with improved isolation arrangements, capacity

# Agenda 9

for future proofing, ability to connect external generator for power outages (i.e. additional resilience) and improved carbon footprint due to reduced power consumption;

- renewal and rationalisation of existing sub-distribution boards; and
- provision of future capacity to allow for the new rolling stock and control systems, which for a significant period will require additional capacity to sustain two systems running in parallel during the implementation phase.

## 3.2 Tender assessment process

In recognition of the specific nature and value of the works a number of potential contractors were notified and a request for quotation (RFQ) was sought from the following:

- John Heaney (Electrical) Limited
- CPMS
- Edmiston Brown & Co Ltd
- WMQ Building Services

The tender was assessed within the basis of a 40:60 quality:cost split, with fixed quality criteria of 'Technical Requirements and Solution', 'Evidence of Capability', 'Quality Assurance', 'Risk Management', 'Programme' and 'Management and Methodology'.

The tenders were assessed by 3 members of project and engineering staff and the quality assessment scores and the cost results are summarised in tables within section 3.3 below.

## 3.3 Tender assessment results

Following the RFQ, two contractors submitted compliant tenders on 23 February 2017. CPMS and WMQ building services ultimately declined to submit a bid due to resources, workload and timing.

The tender scores are summarised as follows:

<b>Tenderer</b>	<b>Submitted Tender Price</b>	<b>Weighted Quality Score (out of 40)</b>	<b>Weighted Cost Score (out of 60)</b>	<b>Combined Score</b>
Edmiston Brown & Co Ltd	£177,235.00	40	59.10	99.10
John Heaney (Electrical) Limited	£174,577.12	27.50	60	87.50

Edmiston Brown & Co Ltd has the highest overall quality score and was able to clearly demonstrate a full understanding of the scope of work, the importance of developing the best design for the depot and also the importance and detailed experience of working in an operational environment.

When quality and cost scores were combined, Edmiston Brown and Co Ltd presented the most economically advantageous tender. Following the tender assessment having shown Edmiston Brown to be the most economically advantageous tender, SPT sought to obtain the best possible price from Edmiston Brown and subsequently obtained a reduction from the originally submitted tender price, resulting in a final price of £171,917.95.

## 3.4 Outline programme

The work is scheduled for completion by the end of 2017 with a detailed programme to be agreed with the contractor following Contract Award and specifically to take account of the more detailed phasing required within the operational environment.

## 4. Conclusions

The tender assessment has shown that Edmiston Brown tender represents the most economically advantageous tender for the Broomloan Depot distribution board renewal works.

## 5. Committee action

The Partnership is recommended to approve the award for the Broomloan Depot Distribution Board works to Edmiston Brown & Co Ltd for the value of £171,917.95.

## 6. Consequences

Policy consequences	<i>None identified.</i>
Legal consequences	<i>None identified.</i>
Financial consequences	<i>The project costs are contained within the 2017/18 Capital Programme, Broomloan Depot Improvements project.</i>
Personnel consequences	<i>None identified.</i>
Equalities consequences	<i>None identified.</i>
Risk consequences	<i>The project requires to be undertaken to remove the risk of failure of the existing critical assets that have reached the end of their design life.</i>

**Name** Eric Stewart  
**Title** Assistant Chief Executive  
(Operations)

**Name** Gordon MacLennan  
**Title** Chief Executive

For further information, please contact *Ross Dalrymple, Project Manager on 0141 333 3659 or Charles Hoskins, Senior Director on 0141 333 3285.*