



Subway Modernisation Station Refurbishments: Kelvinbridge Station Award of Contract

Date of meeting 17 June 2016

Date of report 25 May 2016

Report by Assistant Chief Executive (Operations)

1. Object of report

To recommend the Partnership approve the award of contract for Kelvinbridge Station refurbishment work to Graham Construction.

2. Background

Members will be aware the award for Cessnock station refurbishment was approved at the Strategy and Programmes meeting in May. This was the first of two lots tendered via Public Contracts Scotland (PCS) Utilities portal. The second lot for Kelvinbridge station was at that point subject to clarifications which have now been concluded.

3. Outline of proposals

3.1 Scope of works

The works at Kelvinbridge will follow the same high quality approach used at the previous stations to provide clean, efficient and modern passenger friendly environment.

The scope includes the replacement of materials to floors, walls and ceilings throughout the station. Wayfinding, information and general signage for passengers will be improved by rationalising signing in line with current branding, upgrading of passenger facilities and equipment, increasing visibility by use of more efficient lighting and will include a wide range of enhancements under the Equalities Act.

The refurbishment follows on from an advanced works contract to deal with water ingress into the station which has been an on-going issue for many years affecting the operation of the station at times of particularly wet weather. The advanced works were completed in 2015 and following a monitoring period the waterproofing has performed well with some minor rectifications. Options within this contract to provide pumps to the escalator machine room or extend the waterproofing to the structure under the lower escalators have not been required due to the success of the waterproofing in the lower concourse. This represents a saving of approximately £150,000 on the original budget for these works. Access provision to key locations within the station for onward monitoring of potential water ingress is included within the scope of the refurbishment works.

The upper escalators to Great Western Road are programmed as part of the Otis escalator contract and will be replaced during this year. Passengers will utilise the adjacent stairs as alternative access to Great Western Road.

The station will generally retain its current layout. The North entrance door to parkland which is closed much of the winter will be removed and the space used for an information wall and relocation of TVMs. This area will also house the controls for the escalators to Great Western Road, which are currently in the lower escalator machine room, this will improve maintenance access to the upper escalators. A Communications room will be created utilising a redundant area within the concourse to support new Rolling Stock and Control System space requirements. An air source heat pump will be housed within a currently voided area in the lower concourse. This will take advantage of near constant year round temperatures in the tunnels and assist in lowering the stations energy cost.

3.2 Tender assessment process

The station tender was issued as one of two lots via Public Contracts Scotland (PCS) Utilities portal to the 3 contractors within the Station Refurbishment Contractor Framework namely; Graham Construction, Sir Robert McAlpine and Clancy Docwra in February 2016. Lot 1 was for Cessnock and Lot 2 was for Kelvinbridge. Lot 1 was awarded to Graham Construction in May 2016, following the Strategy & Programmes Committee on 20 May.

The tender was assessed within the basis of a 40:60 quality:cost split, with fixed quality criteria of 'Relevant Experience', 'Quality and Safety' and 'Management and Methodology'.

The tenders were assessed by 3 members of SPT staff and supported by a separate review of costs by our independent cost consultant. The quality assessment scores and the cost results are summarised in tables within section 3.3.

3.3 Tender assessment results

Two Contractors submitted compliant tenders on 4 April 2016, Sir Robert McAlpine withdrew shortly after the commencement of the tender due to work commitments and following clarifications, the final tender scores are detailed in the tables.

Lot 1: Kelvinbridge				
Tenderers	Tender Price	Weighted Quality Score (out of 40)	Weighted Cost Score (out of 60)	Combined Score
Clancy Docwra	£3,847,301.29	37.16	49.55	86.71
Graham Construction	£3,177,166.00	40	60	100
Sir Robert McAlpine	N/A	-	-	-

When quality and cost scores were combined Graham Construction presented the most economically advantageous tender. Graham Construction presented the best quality specifically on management and methodology, where they clearly demonstrated a more thorough understanding of programming. They demonstrated an understanding with mitigating the noise impact of the works on residential properties, and manage limited access within the station. They also provided the best quality team with a suitably experienced project manager. Their submission showed

the best understanding of managing continuous improvement and demonstrated elements of innovation.

3.4 Value engineering review

Following on from lessons learned from previous projects a value engineering exercise was undertaken with the preferred bidder to assess opportunity for efficiency savings in line with overall Subway Modernisation programme objectives.

The exercise concluded that there were a number of aspects of the tendered scope including escalator canopy materials, elements of the mechanical & electrical scope and reusing existing signage that could provide a cost saving of £505,652.40.

It is proposed to accept the savings from the value engineering exercise, leading to an overall contract cost of £2,671,513.60.

3.5 Outline programme

The work at Kelvinbridge will be scheduled for completion by summer 2017. A detailed contract programme will be agreed with the contractor upon Contract Award, taking account of mobilisation times and interfaces with the Otis escalator replacement.

3.6 Further information

The tender process took into consideration the fact that Kelvinbridge station is located close to housing, highlighting issues of noise and access to the tenderers, stressing the importance of these issues when carrying out the works.

Residents of all nearby properties were previously alerted by letter when the advanced works for the project were carried out, also advising of the refurbishment of the station.

SPT Operations staff and the contractor will continue to engage with residents throughout the duration of the works.

4. Conclusion

The tender submission for Kelvinbridge Station by Graham Construction was assessed as the most economically advantageous tender, taking account of both quality and cost as outlined in the tendering criteria, therefore, they are recommended to be the preferred tenderer.

5. Partnership action

The Partnership is recommended to approve the award of contract for Kelvinbridge Refurbishment Works to Graham Construction up to £2,671,513.60 excluding VAT.

6. Consequences

Policy consequences

This is part of subway modernisation which meets the strategic priority of 'Revitalising the Subway Network'.

Legal consequences

Contract Notice is not required to be posted in OJEU and the award is not subject to the statutory

standstill period as this is tendered through the Station Refurbishment Framework, but unsuccessful bidders will be advised in the normal manner and offered debriefing meetings. Contract with Graham Construction will require to be formally executed.

Financial consequences

The tendered sum is proposed to be accommodated within the 2016/17 and 2017/18 Capital Programme Category 1 Project 10022 Station Improvements.

Personnel consequences

Existing internal project management resources to be used.

Equalities consequences

Works include improved access for all.

Risk consequences

Risks have been mitigated through lessons learned from previous station refurbishment projects, most notably the undertaking of additional survey works prior to the main works commencing. Residual risks will be managed by SPT and if required any unforeseen conditions will utilise the station improvements contingency.

Name Eric Stewart
Title Assistant Chief Executive
(Operations)

Name Gordon MacLennan
Title Chief Executive

For further information, please contact *David Gardner, Senior Project Manager* on 0141 333 3132.